

The cover of the journal 'Revista Inclusiones' features a dark blue night sky with a prominent galaxy. A telescope is visible in the lower center, its lens reflecting the light of the galaxy. The background is composed of several overlapping, semi-transparent geometric shapes in shades of blue, green, and red, creating a dynamic, layered effect. The title 'REVISTA INCLUSIONES' is printed in large, bold, white capital letters across the middle of the cover.

REVISTA INCLUSIONES

NUEVOS AVANCES Y MIRADAS DE LA CIENCIA

Revista de Humanidades y Ciencias Sociales

Número Especial Julio / Septiembre

2019

ISSN 0719-4706

CUERPO DIRECTIVO

Directores

Dr. Juan Guillermo Mansilla Sepúlveda

Universidad Católica de Temuco, Chile

Dr. Francisco Ganga Contreras

Universidad de Los Lagos, Chile

Subdirectores

Mg © Carolina Cabezas Cáceres

Universidad de Las Américas, Chile

Dr. Andrea Mutolo

Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México, México

Editor

Drdo. Juan Guillermo Estay Sepúlveda

Editorial Cuadernos de Sofía, Chile

Editor Científico

Dr. Luiz Alberto David Araujo

Pontificia Universidade Católica de Sao Paulo, Brasil

Editor Brasil

Drdo. Maicon Herverton Lino Ferreira da Silva

Universidade da Pernambuco, Brasil

Editor Ruropa del Este

Dr. Alekzandar Ivanov Katrandhiev

Universidad Suroeste "Neofit Rilski", Bulgaria

Cuerpo Asistente

Traductora: Inglés

Lic. Pauline Corthorn Escudero

Editorial Cuadernos de Sofía, Chile

Traductora: Portugués

Lic. Elaine Cristina Pereira Menegón

Editorial Cuadernos de Sofía, Chile

Portada

Sr. Felipe Maximiliano Estay Guerrero

Editorial Cuadernos de Sofía, Chile

COMITÉ EDITORIAL

Dra. Carolina Aroca Toloza

Universidad de Chile, Chile

Dr. Jaime Bassa Mercado

Universidad de Valparaíso, Chile

Dra. Heloísa Bellotto

Universidad de Sao Paulo, Brasil

Dra. Nidia Burgos

Universidad Nacional del Sur, Argentina

Mg. María Eugenia Campos

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Francisco José Francisco Carrera

Universidad de Valladolid, España

Mg. Keri González

Universidad Autónoma de la Ciudad de México, México

Dr. Pablo Guadarrama González

Universidad Central de Las Villas, Cuba

Mg. Amelia Herrera Lavanchy

Universidad de La Serena, Chile

Mg. Cecilia Jofré Muñoz

Universidad San Sebastián, Chile

Mg. Mario Lagomarsino Montoya

Universidad Adventista de Chile, Chile

Dr. Claudio Llanos Reyes

Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Chile

Dr. Werner Mackenbach

Universidad de Potsdam, Alemania

Universidad de Costa Rica, Costa Rica

Mg. Rocío del Pilar Martínez Marín

Universidad de Santander, Colombia

Ph. D. Natalia Milanesio

Universidad de Houston, Estados Unidos

Dra. Patricia Virginia Moggia Münchmeyer

Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, Chile

Ph. D. Maritza Montero

Universidad Central de Venezuela, Venezuela

Dra. Eleonora Pencheva

Universidad Suroeste Neofit Rilski, Bulgaria

Dra. Rosa María Regueiro Ferreira

Universidad de La Coruña, España

Mg. David Ruete Zúñiga

Universidad Nacional Andrés Bello, Chile

Dr. Andrés Saavedra Barahona

Universidad San Clemente de Ojrid de Sofía, Bulgaria

Dr. Efraín Sánchez Cabra
Academia Colombiana de Historia, Colombia

Dra. Mirka Seitz
Universidad del Salvador, Argentina

Ph. D. Stefan Todorov Kapralov
South West University, Bulgaria

COMITÉ CIENTÍFICO INTERNACIONAL

Comité Científico Internacional de Honor

Dr. Adolfo A. Abadía
Universidad ICESI, Colombia

Dr. Carlos Antonio Aguirre Rojas
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Martino Contu
Universidad de Sassari, Italia

Dr. Luiz Alberto David Araujo
Pontificia Universidad Católica de Sao Paulo, Brasil

Dra. Patricia Brogna
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Horacio Capel Sáez
Universidad de Barcelona, España

Dr. Javier Carreón Guillén
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Lancelot Cowie
Universidad West Indies, Trinidad y Tobago

Dra. Isabel Cruz Ovalle de Amenabar
Universidad de Los Andes, Chile

Dr. Rodolfo Cruz Vadillo
Universidad Popular Autónoma del Estado de Puebla, México

Dr. Adolfo Omar Cueto
Universidad Nacional de Cuyo, Argentina

Dr. Miguel Ángel de Marco
Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dra. Emma de Ramón Acevedo
Universidad de Chile, Chile

Dr. Gerardo Echeita Sarrionandia
Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, España

Dr. Antonio Hermosa Andújar
Universidad de Sevilla, España

Dra. Patricia Galeana
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dra. Manuela Garau
Centro Studi Sea, Italia

Dr. Carlo Ginzburg Ginzburg
Scuola Normale Superiore de Pisa, Italia
Universidad de California Los Ángeles, Estados Unidos

Dr. Francisco Luis Girardo Gutiérrez
Instituto Tecnológico Metropolitano, Colombia

José Manuel González Freire
Universidad de Colima, México

Dra. Antonia Heredia Herrera
Universidad Internacional de Andalucía, España

Dr. Eduardo Gomes Onofre
Universidade Estadual da Paraíba, Brasil

Dr. Miguel León-Portilla
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Miguel Ángel Mateo Saura
Instituto de Estudios Albacetenses "Don Juan Manuel", España

Dr. Carlos Tulio da Silva Medeiros
Diálogos em MERCOSUR, Brasil

+ Dr. Álvaro Márquez-Fernández
Universidad del Zulia, Venezuela

Dr. Oscar Ortega Arango
Universidad Autónoma de Yucatán, México

Dr. Antonio-Carlos Pereira Menaut
Universidad Santiago de Compostela, España

Dr. José Sergio Puig Espinosa
Dilemas Contemporáneos, México

Dra. Francesca Randazzo
Universidad Nacional Autónoma de Honduras, Honduras

Dra. Yolando Ricardo

Universidad de La Habana, Cuba

Dr. Manuel Alves da Rocha

Universidade Católica de Angola Angola

Mg. Arnaldo Rodríguez Espinoza

Universidad Estatal a Distancia, Costa Rica

Dr. Miguel Rojas Mix

*Coordinador la Cumbre de Rectores Universidades
Estatales América Latina y el Caribe*

Dr. Luis Alberto Romero

CONICET / Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dra. Maura de la Caridad Salabarría Roig

Dilemas Contemporáneos, México

Dr. Adalberto Santana Hernández

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Dr. Juan Antonio Seda

Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dr. Saulo Cesar Paulino e Silva

Universidad de Sao Paulo, Brasil

Dr. Miguel Ángel Verdugo Alonso

Universidad de Salamanca, España

Dr. Josep Vives Rego

Universidad de Barcelona, España

Dr. Eugenio Raúl Zaffaroni

Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dra. Blanca Estela Zardel Jacobo

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, México

Comité Científico Internacional

Mg. Paola Aceituno

Universidad Tecnológica Metropolitana, Chile

Ph. D. María José Aguilar Idañez

Universidad Castilla-La Mancha, España

Dra. Elian Araujo

Universidad de Mackenzie, Brasil

Mg. Romyana Atanasova Popova

Universidad Suroeste Neofit Rilski, Bulgaria

Dra. Ana Bénard da Costa

Instituto Universitario de Lisboa, Portugal

Centro de Estudos Africanos, Portugal

Dra. Alina Bestard Revilla

*Universidad de Ciencias de la Cultura Física y el
Deporte, Cuba*

Dra. Noemí Brenta

Universidad de Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dra. Rosario Castro López

Universidad de Córdoba, España

Ph. D. Juan R. Coca

Universidad de Valladolid, España

Dr. Antonio Colomer Vialdel

Universidad Politécnica de Valencia, España

Dr. Christian Daniel Cwik

Universidad de Colonia, Alemania

Dr. Eric de Léséulec

INS HEA, Francia

Dr. Andrés Di Masso Tarditti

Universidad de Barcelona, España

Ph. D. Mauricio Dimant

Universidad Hebrea de Jerusalén, Israel

Dr. Jorge Enrique Elías Caro

Universidad de Magdalena, Colombia

Dra. Claudia Lorena Fonseca

Universidad Federal de Pelotas, Brasil

Dra. Ada Gallegos Ruiz Conejo

Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, Perú

Dra. Carmen González y González de Mesa

Universidad de Oviedo, España

Ph. D. Valentin Kitanov

Universidad Suroeste Neofit Rilski, Bulgaria

Mg. Luis Oporto Ordóñez

Universidad Mayor San Andrés, Bolivia

Dr. Patricio Quiroga

Universidad de Valparaíso, Chile

Dr. Gino Ríos Patio

Universidad de San Martín de Porres, Per

Dr. Carlos Manuel Rodríguez Arrechavaleta

Universidad Iberoamericana Ciudad de México, México

Dra. Vivian Romeu

Universidad Iberoamericana Ciudad de México, México

Dra. María Laura Salinas

Universidad Nacional del Nordeste, Argentina

Dr. Stefano Santasilia

Universidad della Calabria, Italia

Mg. Silvia Laura Vargas López

Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Morelos, México

Dra. Jaqueline Vassallo

Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina

Dr. Evandro Viera Ouriques

Universidad Federal de Río de Janeiro, Brasil

Dra. María Luisa Zagalaz Sánchez

Universidad de Jaén, España

Dra. Maja Zawierzeniec

Universidad Wszechnica Polska, Polonia

Editorial Cuadernos de Sofía

Santiago – Chile

Representante Legal

Juan Guillermo Estay Sepúlveda Editorial

Indización, Repositorios y Bases de Datos Académicas

Revista Inclusiones, se encuentra indizada en:





REX



UNIVERSITY OF SASKATCHEWAN



Universidad de Concepción



BIBLIOTECA UNIVERSIDAD DE CONCEPCIÓN

**EXERCISING THE RIGHT TO PROTECTION OF HUMAN AND CIVIL RIGHTS
AND FREEDOMS IN THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS**

Natalya A. Zhukova

Belgorod State University, Russia

Silva M. Arzumanova

Pyatigorsk State University, Russia

Andrey B. Novikov

St. Petersburg State University of Economics, Russia

Olga V. Dyachenko

North Caucasus Federal University, Russia

Aleksandr V. Suhanov

The Institute of Service Sector and Entrepreneurship (Branch) of DSTU in Shakhty, Russia

Fecha de Recepción: 10 de marzo de 2019 – **Fecha Revisión:** 01 de abril de 2019

Fecha de Aceptación: 25 de junio de 2019 – **Fecha de Publicación:** 01 de julio de 2019

Abstract

This paper is based on the analysis of some international legal acts, monographic and scientific publications. It also considers practice of hearing cases on protection of human and civil rights and freedoms by the European Court of Human Rights and implementation of its rulings in European countries. This analysis made it possible to identify some of the problems associated with evaluating the effectiveness of the work of this court. The conclusions are formulated about the attempts to create a world-wide common practice of judicial resolution of disputes related to the violation of the right to protection of human and civil rights and freedoms.

Keywords

European Court of Human Rights – Human and civil rights and freedoms
Responsibility – Jurisdiction

Para Citar este Artículo:

Zhurkova, Natalya A.; Arzumanova, Silva M.; Novikov, Andrey B.; Dyachenko, Olga V. y Suhanov, Aleksandr V. Exercising the right to Protection of Human and Civil Rights and Freedoms in the European Court of Human Rights. Revista Inclusiones Vol: 6 num Esp Jul-Sep (2019): 12-17.

Introduction

The European Court of Human Rights is an international body which jurisdiction extends to all member states of the European Council that have ratified the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms and concerns all matters relating to the interpretation and application of the Convention, including interstate cases and individual complaints.

In this paper, we will rely on the scientific work of such authors as B. Wiecek¹, H. Roth², G. N. Herlitz³, S. Haß⁴, C. Löser⁵, A.-C. Zoellner⁶, E. Tonkov⁷, M. Markhgeym, A. Nifanov, A. Novikova⁸ and others.

The main international legal instruments in the field of human rights are: The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; Convention on the Rights of the Child.

These international legal instruments, as well as other ones, provide for a variety of measures to facilitate the implementation of agreements on human rights, and protection of these rights.

International procedures in the field of human rights are divided into different groups by their methods of implementation and sources of information and include: consideration of state reports on the fulfillment of their obligations in the field of ensuring human rights, consideration of state claims to each other for violations of such obligations, examination and investigation of situations related to human rights violations which are alleged or established by domestic means, compilation of special lists containing information about the persons responsible for human rights violations, initiation of requests for individual criminal responsibility, consideration of complaints from individuals, groups or non-governmental organizations on violations of their rights. A person who wants to exercise the right to protect his/her human rights and freedoms has the opportunity to choose a variety of procedures and organizations.

¹ Zivilprozessordnung und Nebengesetze Großkommentar. Band 4: §§ 253–299^a. B. Wiecek, R.A. Schütze, H.-J. Ahrens, D. Assmann, S. Weth. 4. Aufl. Berlin, 2013. 1175 S.

² H. Roth, Die "tatsächliche Vermutung" im Zivilprozess. A Festschrift for prof. Dr. Hakan Pekcanitez. Izmir. 2015.

³ G. N. Herlitz, The Meaning of the Term "Prima Facie". Louisiana Law Review. Vol: 55, iss 2. 1994.

⁴ S. Haß, Die Urteile des Europäischen Gerichtshofs für Menschenrechte. Charakter, Bindungswirkung und Durchsetzung. Peter Lang GmbH. Frankfurt a/M. 2006.

⁵ C. Löser, Die Wirkung von EMRK und Urteilen des EGMR in Deutschland. Übung Staatsrecht. 2014.

http://www.cloeser.org/pub/Staatsrecht_+_Verfassungsprozessrecht/19%20EMRK%20und%20EGMR%20-%20Teil%201.pdf

⁶ A.-C. Zoellner, Das Verhältnis von Bundesverfassungsgericht und Europäischem Gerichtshof für Menschenrechte. Verlag Dr. Kovac. Hamburg. 2010.

⁷ I. N. Kuksin; E. E. Tonkov; E. V. Safronova; E. M. Vasekina and E. I. Shabalina, The constitutional experience of consolidation the human rights function of the state in the post-soviet space. The Turkish Online Journal of Design, Art and Communication TOJDAC. April. Special Edition. 2017.

⁸ Butko, L. V.; Markhgeym, M. V.; Nifanov, A. N.; Novikova, A. E. and Usatov, S. A. Territory in the constitutional standards of federal states. Journal of Politics and Law. Vol: 10 num 4 (2017): 221-224.

Our study analyzed the first section of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, where articles 2-13 contain rights and freedoms subject to international protection.

Methods

Various general scientific methods and ways of logical cognition were used in the work: system, analysis and synthesis, abstraction, and formal-logical approaches. The disclosure of the topic was facilitated by the use of linguistic-legal, formal-legal and comparative-legal methods.

Discussion and results

Human and civil rights and freedoms are enshrined in the first section of the European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms. Their list which is not exhaustive, include:

- The right of ownership, the right to education, the right to participate in free elections by secret ballot (1st protocol dated March 20, 1952);
- The right to freedom of movement, the right to choose a place of residence, the right to enter / leave to / from any country (the protocol dated September 16, 1963);
- The prohibition of the death penalty (protocol 6 of April 28, 1983);
- The right to comply with the procedure for expulsion of aliens, the right to appeal in criminal cases, the right to compensation in case of judicial error, the right not to be re-tried and punished, the establishment of equality of spouses (protocol 7 dated November 22, 1984);
- The right to secrecy when entering for consideration by the European Court of Justice or for consideration of complaints and reports on complaints by an expanded or truncated composition of the Court (Protocol 9 dated November 6, 1990).⁹

The European Court of Human Rights does not separate the rights and freedoms of a person and citizen on a sectoral basis. In the opinion of the European Court of Human Rights, the nature of the violated (protected) right is important, and not the branch of legislation or the type of legal proceedings within which the question of violation of human and civil rights has arisen. The protected rights of a person and a citizen may concern private-law or public relations. In the opinion of the European Court and the Commission on Human Rights, important is a violation of individual law.

Thus, the most frequently encountered cases on the protection of human and civil rights in the European Court of Justice include:

- The right to equality of spouses
- The right to a fair trial;
- The right to compensation in case of a judicial error;
- The right to decent conditions of detention;
- The right to appeal against actions and decisions of state bodies (officials);
- The right to a reasonable time for consideration of cases, etc.

⁹ <http://www.echr.europa.org/convention/protocols.htm>

Of course, the observance of the procedure for exercising the right to protect such a right in the national system of state bodies or courts should be taken into account.

It is important to understand that the European Court of Human Rights provides an opportunity to protect those human rights and freedoms that are protected by law (not only national but also in particular the European Convention). If the interests of a person do not fall into this category, their protection cannot be a subject of consideration either in the national court or in the European court.

The right to protection of human rights and freedoms can be exercised both in national state and judicial bodies, and in interstate ones, that is confirmed by the provision of Article 13 of the European Convention: every person whose rights and freedoms set forth in this Convention have been violated has effective means of legal defense against state bodies even if such a violation was committed by persons acting in capacity of an official.

For many people who applied to the European Court of Human Rights, this was the last opportunity to restore their violated right or freedom. In the global ranking, more than 70% of the citizens of Sweden, Germany, Switzerland, Belgium, Finland and more than 50% of the citizens of Russia supported such an opportunity. Citizens of Turkey, Lebanon, Serbia, China and Ecuador did not give such high credence to intergovernmental bodies. Perhaps this is due to the peculiarities of the mentality inherent to the citizens of these countries.¹⁰

The legal system of the countries that have ratified the Convention on Protection of Rights and recognized the jurisdiction of the European Court of Human Rights has undergone positive changes that have helped to reform the judicial system in order to strengthen the guarantees of the realization of the human right to protection of rights.

However, contradictions exist between the national law of European countries and the provisions of the Convention on the Protection of Human Rights.

One of these contradictions is the attitude towards criminal penalties. In Spain, for example, terrorists are not eligible for parole. And by decision of the European Court of Human Rights, convicts who have served a sentence of imprisonment for more than 30 years are subject to release. In the UK, persons who have committed serious and especially grave crimes with extreme cruelty are condemned to life imprisonment. With regard to Great Britain, the European Court of Justice had considered that every 25 years the cases in which the sentence is connected with life imprisonment are subject to review with a view to showing humanity to the convicts and freeing them from punishment.

In many cases, the contradictions that we are talking about arise due to a broad interpretation of the provisions of the Convention by the judges of the European Court of Human Rights. For example, when deciding in the case of “Tyrerr against the United Kingdom”, the judges of the ECHR stated the thesis: “The convention is a living instrument that should be interpreted in the light of today’s conditions”.

The main causes of contradictions are:

¹⁰ <http://www.wingia.com>

- Opposition of the judges' own opinion to the established practice of the European Court under the influence of various factors (political, economic, etc.);
- Reaching a consensus among the judges of the European Court and representatives of European states, in support of the positions of their countries.

However, there are other examples of execution of judgments held by the European Court. For example, in the case of *Görgühl*, the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany decided that the integration of Germany into the world community does not provide for the renunciation of sovereignty of this country, but contributes to the implementation of fundamental constitutional principles.¹¹ By the way, Germany is an example of such integration. Decisions of the European Court of Human Rights are regularly published there, analyzed and integrated into national legislation and law enforcement practice.

Conclusions

Thus, the European Court of Human Rights remains an important link in the system of intergovernmental bodies granting the right to any person to protect their rights and freedoms, if the national possibilities for that are exhausted. Considering that such decisions are made primarily to protect the rights and freedoms of citizens, the state must fulfill the decisions of the European Court of Human Rights. However, it is also necessary to eliminate the contradictions that impede the execution of judgments of the European Court by the states that ratify the Convention.

References

Butko, L. V.; Markhgeym, M. V.; Nifanov, A. N.; Novikova, A. E. and Usatov, S. A. Territory in the constitutional standards of federal states. *Journal of Politics and Law*. Vol: 10 num 4 (2017): 221-224.

Haß, S. *Die Urteile des Europäischen Gerichtshofs für Menschenrechte. Charakter, Bindungswirkung und Durchsetzung*. Peter Lang GmbH. Frankfurt a/M. 2006.

Herlitz, G.N. The Meaning of the Term "Prima Facie". *Louisiana Law Review*. Vol: 55, iss 2 (1994).

Kuksin, I. N.; Tonkov, E. E.; Safronova, E. V.; Vasekina, E. M. and Shabalina, E. I. The constitutional experience of consolidation the human rights function of the state in the post-soviet space. *The Turkish Online Journal of Design, Art and Communication TOJDAC*. April. Special Edition. 2017.

Löser, C. *Die Wirkung von EMRK und Urteilen des EGMR in Deutschland. Übung Staatsrecht*. 2014. http://www.cloeser.org/pub/Staatsrecht_+_Verfassungsprozessrecht/19%20EMRK%20und%20EGMR%20-%20Teil%201.pdf

Roth, H. *Die "tatsächliche Vermutung" im Zivilprozess*. A Festschrift for prof. Dr. Hakan Pekcanitez. Izmir. 2015.

¹¹ Resolution of the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany dated October 14, 2004 No. 2 BvR 1481/04 on the complaint of K. Görgühl. http://www.bverfg.de/entscheidungen/rs20041014_2bvr148104.html

Exercising the right to Protection of Human and Civil Rights and Freedoms in the European Court of Human Rights pág. 17

Resolution of the Federal Constitutional Court of Germany dated October 14, 2004 No. 2 BvR 1481/04 on the complaint of K. Görgühl.
http://www.bverfg.de/entscheidungen/rs20041014_2bvr148104.html

Zivilprozessordnung und Nebengesetze Großkommentar. Band 4: §§ 253–299^a. B. Wieczorek, R.A. Schütze, H.-J. Ahrens, D. Assmann, S. Weth. 4. Aufl. Berlin, 2013. 1175 S.

Zoellner, A.-C. Das Verhältnis von Bundesverfassungsgericht und Europäischem Gerichtshof für Menschenrechte. Verlag Dr. Kovac. Hamburg. 2010.

Linkografía

<http://www.echr.ru/convention/protocols.htm>

<http://www.wingia.com>

CUADERNOS DE SOFÍA EDITORIAL

Las opiniones, análisis y conclusiones del autor son de su responsabilidad y no necesariamente reflejan el pensamiento de la **Revista Inclusiones**.

La reproducción parcial y/o total de este artículo debe hacerse con permiso de **Revista Inclusiones**.